



**Report of Post Budget Workshop on
Gender Responsive Budgeting
October 23-24,2010
Shangri-la Hotel Muree**

List of Contents

1. Background of Workshop
2. Objectives of follow up workshop
3. Proceedings of workshop
4. Opening Session
5. Session on Key Highlights of Green Book
6. Recap of Previous workshop
7. Presentation by Ministry of Health
8. Presentation by Ministry of Food & Agriculture
9. Presentation by Ministry of Education
10. Recap of Day 1
11. Presentation by Ministry of Population Welfare
12. Presentation by Ministry of Social Welfare & Special Education
13. Evaluation of the workshop
14. Concluding Remarks by Mr. Saghir Bukhari
15. Decisions
16. Recommendations

Annexure:

Annex-I	Schedule of Workshop
Annex- II	List of Participants
Annex-III	Presentations MTBF, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Food & Agriculture , Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Welfare,& Special Education, Ministry of Population.
Annex-IV	Workshop Evaluation forms

Background:

Subsequent upon approval of Medium Term Budgetary Framework (MTBF) roll out from Cabinet on January 21,2009, execution is in progress with 49 Ministries at Federal level. MTBF is a three-year rolling budget framework that allows the Government to gauge past performances with regard to the budgetary allocations and make medium-term future plans based on that performance. It requires ministries to lay out policy priorities, develop specific indicators, compute resource allocations for achieving them and lay down the different methods in which they will be achieved.

The Government of Pakistan is committed to maintain gender equality in policies, targeted programs and pro-women allocations in the federal budget with the intention to bridge Gender gap in acquiring access to basic services and in development process. Strengthening PRS Monitoring project (SPRSMP) in pursuance of Gender Responsive Budgeting initiatives has developed linkages and synergies with MTBF Secretariat. As a result of collaboration, additional gender sensitive amendments in the MTBF Budget Call Circular (BCC) has been introduced to address gender inequalities in conventional budgeting system.

In the second phase, SPRSMP trained the MTBF focal persons in different Ministries on various tools of Gender Responsive Budgeting. The Project had conducted two workshops on Gender Responsive Budgeting on February 24th-25th,2010 for six Ministries/Divisions for MTBF Core Teams of 6 Ministries comprises of Ministry of Education, Health, LGRD, Social welfare, Population Welfare, Food and Agriculture in collaboration with UNIFEM.

Objectives of this induction workshop were as follows;

- I. Induction to GRB and Gender Equality Commitments of Pakistan.
- II. Orientation to gender indicators and gender integration into budgetary process.

As a sequel to post Budget, a follow up session on Gender responsive budgeting was planned on October 22nd -24th, 2010 for the same group of participants from Social Sector Ministries. The follow up session aimed to strengthen skills of concerned officers on Gender Responsive Budgeting and share experiences in applying Gender Responsive Budgeting tools while making the budget of FY 2010-11 in line with gender responsive amendments introduced in Budget Call Circular.

Participants were briefed about the presentation template to transcribe their key learning on GRB tools prior to attend the workshop.

Objectives of follow up session were as below;

1. Objectives of post Budget workshop:

- i. Induction on key highlights of MTBF Green Book.
- ii. Review key learning of Budget teams of social sector Ministries on Gender Responsive Budgeting tools.
- iii. Strengthen learning and understanding of Gender Responsive Budgeting tools.

2. Proceedings of Workshop

Day I

Registration of participants processed in first session followed by recitation from Holy Quran.

3. Opening Session:

Mr. Mahmood Akhtar, Joint Secretary, External Finance–Policy/National Project Director, Strengthening PRS Monitoring Project, welcomed all the participants. He acknowledged UNIFEM for their continuous and generous support for gender mainstreaming in budgetary process. He emphasized on the significance of the subject in current development scenario and affirmative actions needed to be executed at planning level. While highlighting importance of integrating gender aspects into budgeting mechanism, he explained that Gender Responsive Budgeting plays a pivotal role in transcribing policy measures into gender sensitive actions. He reassured that basic orientation workshop on GRB tools laid a foundation for strengthening learning of GRB tools. This Post Budget workshop aims to recapitulate and assess learning of previous GRB training and its impact on Budget making process in Gender responsive manners.

4. Session on Key highlights of Green book:

Mr. Ayub Khan Team Leader, MTBF, Finance Division shared a brief and concise presentation giving background to MTBF, formulation of Green Book, compilation

process and efficacy of Green Book. He further described Budget by Outcomes, Budget by Outputs (Service Delivery), selected performance indicators and targets by outputs related to Ministry of health reflected in Green Book.

While introducing Green Book, he briefed that the book provides budget details with performance measuring indicators at output and outcome level. It further reflects proportion of budgets used by Ministries with achievements. Green Books would be used as a tool for Result Based Management and facilitate 49 entities(Divisions) for effective planning of human & financial resources for three consecutive years as this first green book provides budget for FY 2010-11 and target details for 2010-11 to 2012-13.

He explained LM-5 (line Ministry) Form, its significance in compilation of Green Book and advantages leading to improved service delivery mechanism and informed decision making. Information reflected in the form supports policy makers, Parliamentarians for approval of budget and rationalization for allocation of resources. Further to this,

- The MTBF Budget Call Circular was forwarded to all Principal Accounting Officers (PAOs) – 5 ‘LM’ Forms and 1 FC Form
- Each PAO formed an MTBF core-team with middle-management members from both budget section and P&D sections
- Each core-team was supported by MTBF Financial Consultant – to train / guide PAOs on filling ‘LM’ forms
- Further trainings on Fund Centre (FC) form were imparted to all the DDOs of the federal government in 4 provincial headquarters and Islamabad
- The Green Book has been compiled using ‘approved’ LM Forms.
- The Green Book has 3 Years of resource predictability on the recurrent and development side - based on Indicative Budget Ceilings (2010-13).
- The exercise of filling ‘LM’ forms led to closer coordination between planning and budgeting staff members
- For performance indicators and targets – coordination with Attached Departments / Senior Mgt was made

- Each of PAO took personal interest in completing the process – most of the ‘LM’ forms have been personally signed by Secretaries
- The Priority Committee reviewed both sides of the budget (for the first time) by looking at the overall strategic priorities of the PAOs inline with budget ceilings as opposed to review of the projects only.
- Some PAOs called it a hallmark of budgeting process – while some other were less optimistic regarding presentation of Green Book to political leadership, honouring ceilings for outer years, ownership and accountability.

Presentation on Green Book by Mr. Ayub was appreciated by all participants and thorough deliberations were made on Green Book related to Ministry of Health supplemented with other examples shared by representatives from Ministry of Education, Health, food & agriculture and others.

5. Recap of previous workshop:

Mr. Sajjad Ahmad Shaikh, NPM, SPRSM Project, briefed participants of the workshop that GRB has been recognized as a key tool deriving towards gender sensitive policies considering equitable resource allocation. In addition, he explained the concept which started in Australia in 1984 to determine the impact of government budget on women’s role and contributions, idea gained momentum internationally after UN Beijing Platform for action in 1995. By 2002, more than 70 countries engaged in gender responsive budgeting are applying various tools, In south Asian countries, Pakistan, India, Nepal, Bangladesh & Sri Lanka are at various stages of engendering their national budgets.

He enlightened participants with information that Pakistan has secured lead in applying all the six Gender Responsive Budgeting tools particularly nation wide Time Use Survey. Govt. of Pakistan committed to undertake GRB in PRSP-I 2003, in 2005 Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative was launched in collaboration with UNDP, and other development partners in Finance Division. PRSP-II again highlights implementation of GRB. Gender Responsive modifications in MTBF budget call circular are made through including monitorable gender related output and outcome indicators.

He further reassured the participants that orientation of GRB tools provided in first workshop held on February 24, 25, 2010 laid foundation to this post Budget workshop. This workshop is structured keeping in view learning needs of participants and will

provide sufficient time for deliberations, clarity of concepts and presentation template shared with participants will explicate key learning of participants in applying GRB tools.

6. Presentation by Ministry of Health

Mr. Saad S. Khan, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Health presented key learning in applying GRB Tools during the Budget formulation exercise. He opened his presentation with thanks to Ministry of Finance for providing them this learning opportunity. Elucidating learning on GRB tools he explained as follows;

- The difference between Gender Equality and Gender Equity
- The need for Gender sensitive budgeting
- Understanding of GRB Tools
- Gender Blind Policy documents perpetuate gender disparities

Mr. Saad briefed participants with introduction to GRB tools with definitions and challenges being faced in health sector to transform budget into Gender Responsive manner.

7. Presentation by Ministry of Food & Agriculture

Mr. Amir Siyal, Deputy Secretary, introduced his presentation with this remarks that GRB has now become part of the deliberations and decision making process regarding budget formulation. He explained the group that they found the first training very useful and the same may be extended to attached/auxiliary offices. Close guidance is required with respect to rationalization of ratio of the women employment in Agriculture Sector. While sharing his views on GRB he explained that application of GRB tools is a useful exercise. It is need of the time to get appropriate recognition of women involved in agriculture for strengthening the economy of the country by utilization their abilities.

Challenges faced in applying GRB tools by the Ministry are as under;

MinFA is facing challenges regarding applying gender desegregation as there is combined job/out put indicators in Agriculture Sector.

* We can apply gender desegregation output indicators only with reference to women employees serving in the various laboratories of Plant Protection Department, Federal Seed Certification & Registration Department and PARC.

* There is fixed recruitment quota for Women which is presently applicable. However, it can be applied in the Agriculture Research activities if the quota for women employment is considered and extended to Agriculture Sector.

Mr. Amir Siyal concluded his presentation with this commitment that efforts are being made to desegregate output indicators with reference to gender responsive budgeting, however, presently most of the output indicators are gender neutral.

8. Presentation by Ministry of Education

Mr. T.M. Qureshi, Deputy Economic Advisor, elucidated participants with commonly used Gender related concepts and terminologies and practices undertaken by the Ministry; Analysis of the expenditures and revenues executed under government's policies and programs for impact on women and girls, men and boys (as well as different groups of women and men categorized by income, age, ethnicity etc)- Gender Analysis of Budget.

- ✓ In the light of these gender budget analyses the implementation of strategies and actions that result in the budget promoting women's empowerment and gender equality- change budgets so that Gender Equality is promoted.
- ✓ It's the combination of these two steps that will produce a gender responsive budget.
- ✓ Sex-disaggregated Output Indicators applied for Current Budget should also be applied for Development Budget. NEMIS already provides vital Edu data on sex-disaggregated number of Institutions, Students Enrolment & Teacher. NEP has expanded its mandate for financial data.

He explained Current & Development Budget, Ministry of Education, provided figures for Institutions by Gender and Location, Gross Enrolment Ratio: Primary, Net Enrolment Ratio: Primary, Literacy Profile Pakistan.

Thorough deliberations were made on difference between equity and equality, Gender Neutral, Gender blind, Gender Specific. It was agreed that development of Gender sensitive project document can be ensured if format for PC-1 is gender sensitive. Mr. Mahmood Akhtar, explained planning cycle and PC-1 format to improve gender sensitive projects.

First Day of the workshop concluded with recap of proceedings.

Day TWO

2nd Day of the workshop started with recitation from Holy Quarn.

9. Recap of Day one

Comments shared by participants of workshop are as follows;

- I. Discussion on GRB was valuable
- II. Experience sharing during discussion made further clarity to the subject
- III. Suggestions submitted by Ministries must be considered for future planning,
- IV. Though making budget more Gender Responsive is a long process but we think we will be able to achieve this target.
- V. Learned about output, outcome and Functioning of Green Book
- VI. Most of the Ministries employed GRB tools in their presentations
- VII. Green book has been revealed as a source of accountability to the planners and implementers.
- VIII. Green book derives policies towards positive actions, Accountability & result measuring tool,
- IX. Ministry of Food & Agriculture requires assistance for this exercise
- X. Regular follow ups should be the part of consultation process.
- XI. Discussions helped in Learning and useful experience.
- XII. Further improvement would be made in upcoming years.

10. Presentation by Ministry of Population Welfare:

Mr. Syed M. Saleem, Deputy Director, paid gratitude to organizers for this wonderful workshop on Gender Budgeting. He explained key learning points as below;

- i. Understanding of concept of GRB.
- ii. Specific Gender output indicators.
- iii. Desegregation of gender budget and expenditure
- iv. Consideration of equity for Gender specific needs among women and men, girls and boys.
- v. Setting of targets on the basis of gender in various activities.
- vi. Emphasis on gender needs in the development policies.
- vii. Review of budget according to the priorities and requirements of gender.

viii. Ensure transparency in spending financial resources.

He reinforced the utility of workshop; found it very useful and requested organizers to provide them with application of GRB Models of other countries and conducting continuous exercise on GRB concepts and frameworks for social sector Ministries.

He explained major challenges in application of GRB tools e.g. they are not aware of any separate policy for Gender, need more orientation on Gender desegregated data. He recommended more capacity building initiatives to apply GRB tools effectively.

11. Presentation by Ministry of Social Welfare:

Mr. Asif Ayub, accounts officer shared his presentation while appreciating the organizers for organizing workshop on this important subject, got awareness about strategic allocation of resources with gender sensitivity, general awareness about Gender Responsive Budgeting, learned about importance and techniques to devise gender desegregated output indicators of the Ministry.

He expressed commitment of their Ministry in learning the techniques and tools for conducting gender based reviews of the projects & programs run by their Ministry.

They were also keen to learn about success of gender sensitive budgeting as a role model either within or out side of Pakistan.

He briefed the participants about the challenges e.g. non cooperation of the attached departments and un-convinced behavior of the officials seen as a major challenge. He concluded his presentation with recommendations placed below.

12. Evaluation of the workshop:

An Evaluation form was circulated and briefed to the participants for their feedback and recommendations. (Filled evaluation form enclosed as Annex).

Participants ranked good satisfaction level for overall workshop design, duration, contents and proceeding format.

Majority expressed their inclination to be the part of regular consultation process, and requested to conduct consultation meetings, orientations for higher management.

13. Concluding Remarks

Mr. Saghir Bukhari, Senior Program Coordinator, UNIFEM paid gratitude to Mr. Mahmood Akhtar, JS (EF)/NPD, Mr. Sajjad Ahmad Shaikh, NPM, SPRSMP, Mr. Ayub Khan, Team Leader MTBF, SPRSMP Team and all the participants for giving UNIFEM this opportunity to be the part of process. He shared brief outline of programs being implemented by UNIFEM.

He requested participants to share one pager report about the workshop to their supervisors in their respective Ministries. He further elaborated about National & International Gender Equality Commitments being implemented by Govt. of Pakistan and encouraged participants to step forward for this cause. He also appreciated the idea of training calendar for periodic training of Gender Responsive Budgeting.

14. Decisions

1. Half Day session to review and devise work plan for effective collaboration of UNIFEM and Finance Division which includes work plan on JPC-4, and devise strategic framework of Gender Responsive Budgeting.
2. Meeting of MOWD, UNIFEM and SPRSMP to discuss, review framework of Institutionalization of GRAP.
3. Sensitization of higher management (includes Secretaries) for smooth implementation.
4. Orientation sessions with concerned group of selected Ministries
5. Consistent consultation with Ministries for effective implementation of GRB.
6. List of workshop Participants shall be included in mailing list for dissemination of Publication.
7. Inclusion of More Ministries for GRB training

Recommendations

Recommendations by Ministry of Health:

- ✘ Extend Gender Responsive Budgeting beyond the seven pilot ministries
- ✘ The Federal Budget presented in Parliament for approval each year should expressly mention gender related outputs and indicators
- ✘ The concept of gender budgeting be introduced in ACCA and accounting courses as well as in CSS academies syllabi

Recommendations by Ministry of Food & Agriculture

- ✘ Preparation of guidelines for implementation of GRB in the Agriculture Sector.
- ✘ Training of officers/staff in the attached/ sub-ordinate offices of MinFA.

Recommendations by Ministry of Education

- ✘ Object Classification in Current budget should have further breakup into Male & Female.
- ✘ Likewise, in Dev. Budget, in clear Gender responsive Budget, before or after Project ID, the letter M or F be added e.g.
- ✘ IDB5354 Estb. Of Secondary School for Boys Isb
- ✘ IDG5355 Estb. Of Secondary School for Girls Isb

Recommendations by Ministry of Social Welfare

- ✘ A continues top-down and bottom up approach should be applied to implement the concepts of Gender Responsive Budgeting.
- ✘ Share with us the key finding of any of Federal Level research studies on specific gender issues in Pakistan's urban and rural setups.
- ✘ We would like GRP project to produce a book containing the successes and experiences in implementing the concept at least in the social sector Ministries and share this book in other Ministries in both languages i.e Urdu and English.
- ✘ A news letter (Quarterly) may also be useful which may include best practices.

Recommendations by Ministry of Population Welfare

- ✘ Refresher Training for GRB personnel
- ✘ Impact of GRB may be shared.
- ✘ Performance review of GRB may be conducted.